

MEMORANDUM

TO: Michael Murawski, Advocate
Miriam Ramos, Deputy General Counsel

FROM: Sylvia Batista, Investigator

DATE: August 2012

RE: K11-012; Community Council Research Project (CC#10)

COE investigators were assigned a project involving an assessment of campaign contributions made to members of Community Councils and the voting record of the respective councils. The project is to research and compare the two variables and submit a report noting any impact by the campaign contributions on the council's voting record on matters brought forth by their campaign contributors.

Investigators were each assigned a different community council and asked to review the records from the time that each council member was elected to the present. This investigator researched Community Council #10, also known as the Westchester Community Council. The campaign treasurer reports ("CTR") were accessed through the Miami-Dade Department of Elections and the CC#10 voting records through the Miami-Dade Permitting, Environment & Regulatory Affairs Department.

The following table lists the names of the council members, the date elected, and the contributor's name, occupation and amount contributed. Associates of corporate contributors were researched and listed for cross-referencing with zoning applicants:

MEMBER	DATE ELECTED	CONTRIBUTORS & ASSOCIATES	AMOUNT
Toufic Zakharia – 102	08/24/10	Self (financial Services)	\$300.00
Richard Gomez – 103	08/24/10	Self (general contractor)	\$500.00
		Builders Association of S. Fl (bldg. industry) – Officers: Fernando Martinez, Alberto Milo and Richard Gomez.	\$500.00
		RETC, Inc. (tile & marble co.) – Officer: Rodolfo Espinosa	\$500.00
		Aaron Herwig (Vice President – Florida)	\$200.00

		Gracie Holdings, LLC (catering) – Officer: Jorge de Mena.	\$127.00
		Florida East Coast Ind. (developer) – Officers: Kolleen Cobb, Vincent Signorello, Juan Godoy, & Rafael Rodon.	\$500.00
		Virginia Llanea (art dealer)	\$100.00
		Marianna Perez (banking)	\$100.00
		Jesus M. Gomez (gen. contractor)	\$500.00
		Alex Castellanos (banker)	\$100.00
		James Werle (real estate)	\$100.00
		B Group Mngmnt (developer) – Officer: Michael Denberg	\$100.00
		Alex P. Lastra (developer)	\$100.00
		Hildie Aristondo (legal assistant)	\$100.00
		Fernando Martinez (realtor)	\$200.00
		Adonel Concrete (concrete supplier) – Gerardo Garcia & Luis Garcia	\$100.00
Jorge Barbontin – 104	08/26/08	No reports on record.	
Julio Caceres – 105	08/24/10	Self (Gen. Election 2006)	\$100.00
		Self (Gen. Election 2010)	\$125.00
Miguel Martinez – 106	08/24/10	Self (Gen. Election 2010)	\$500.00
		Dr. Manuel Solis (doctor)	\$106.00
		Marcos Cabrera (firefighter)	\$106.00
		Mario Lopez (personal trainer)	\$106.00
		Daniel Martinez (doctor)	\$106.00
		David Menendez (doctor)	\$106.00
		Moises Arroyo (police officer)	\$106.00
		Mateo Arroyo (teacher)	\$106.00
		Diego Lopez (student)	\$106.00
		Douglas Cabrera (student)	\$106.00
		Daniel Martinez (doctor)	\$145.00
		David Menendez (doctor)	\$145.00
		Ernesto Vega (not provided)	\$100.00
		Investment LLC (investment)	\$500.00
		Dr. Manuel Solis (doctor)	\$145.00
		Development Corp., Blue Lakes (development) a/k/a Blue Lakes Development Corp. – Officers: Bruce Rapee, Sonya Rapee, Leanne Rapee and Marjorie Z. Rammos	\$500.00
		Aurora Perez (realtor)	\$300.00
		Gerardo Van Dalen (pastor)	\$300.00

The following is a list of zoning applicants who brought items before CC#10 from the time when the candidate(s) took office to the present, and the outcome of each application:

ZONING APPLICANT	HEARING DATE	VOTING RECORD
Miguel M. Cardelles	9/15/10	Approved
Cosette Sanchez	9/15/10	Approved
Farm Stores Corp. Owner: Marguerite Routenberg Reps: Andres Rodriguez & Carlos Bareu	9/15/10	Approved
Lyndon Ontivero	9/15/10	Approved
Naseem T. Uddin Owner: NE Sunrise Investments Corp. Rep. Paul H. Freeman	9/15/10	Deferred
Fernando Rodriguez	9/15/10	Deferred
Fernando Rodriguez	10/20/10	Approved
Edward Cabrera/Grizelle Arencibia	10/20/10	Approved
Naseem T. Uddin Owner: NE Sunrise Investments Corp. Rep. Rolin Sanchez-Mandina and Paul H. Freeman	10/20/10	Approved in part
T-Mobile South LLC & United States Development LTD Owner: United States Development Ltd. Luis Cruz (100% owner of stocks)	10/20/10	Approved
Gustavo Duanys, et al. Owners: Duanys & Iglesias Gustavo & Libia	11/30/10	Approved
Westchester Spanish Christian Church Inc. Owner: United States Development Ltd. The Rock-Miami Church, Inc. Pastor: Alfredo Perez	11/30/10	Approved
Anthony B. Wilson	11/30/10	Deferred
Anthony B. Wilson	01/12/11	Approved
Mebahiah, Inc. Owner: Ernesto A. Gonzalez (100% stock)	01/12/11	Approved in part
Christian & Jessica Garcell de Gomez	01/12/11	Approved
Florida Power & Light Co. Owner: NextEra Energy, Inc. Orot Flagler, LLC Manuel Grosskopf Armando Olivera – FPL President & CEO	01/12/11	Approved
Alberto Caro & Jeanette Farach Caro	01/12/11	Deferred
Cecilio Gamez	02/09/11	Approved
Cecilio Gamez	02/09/11	Approved

Citibank, N.A. Owner: 8701 Bird Road Associates LLC James Randel, David Cohen, Harold Levy Rep. David Sacks, Esq., Pathman Lewis	04/06/11	Approved
Tomas Gonzalez (Melba)	04/06/11	Approved
FVP Dorado LLC, owner Contract for purchase with Roberto & Dolores Gonzalez	05/04/11	Approved
Wachovia Owner: Westchester Mall Assoc. Ltd. Partners – John Usdan, Jed Isaacs, Jane Schoenholtz, John Isaacs, James Caissy, Madeline Noveck, PFREA LLC (c/o Josh Polan)	06/02/11	Approved
84 Shopping Plaza Corp. Owners: Daniel Arias & Miriam Arias	06/02/11	Approved
Life Church of South Florida, Inc. f/k/a Bird Road Baptist Church Owners: Rev. David F. Mayoral, Miriam Mayoral, Patricia Fulton and Noel Betancourt Contract for Purchase: Apostolate of Divine Mercy, Inc. Owners: Dulce M. de los Reyes, Rafael A. de los Reyes, Jorge Almirall, Jose E. Fuentes, & Mercy Martinez (1275)	07/07/11	Approved
Highpoint Academy, Inc. Owner: Alicia A. Casanova	07/07/11	Approved
Eugenio & Aida Villar	09/07/11	Approved
M-D County Dept. of Housing & community Dev.	09/07/11	Approved
Vincent Carey Mir & Ethel Youmans Mir	09/07/11	Approved
84 Shopping Plaza Corp. Owners: Daniel Arias & Miriam Arias Rep. Simon Ferro	09/07/11	Denied w/out prejudice
Conchita Espinosa Academy Owners: Maribel Z. Diaz, Carol Diaz-Zubieta & Ana Diaz-Zubieta	09/07/11	Approved
Belen Jesuit Preparatory School, Inc. Principals: Pedro A. Suarez, Guillermo Garcia-Tunon, Pedro Cartaya. Rep. Simon Ferro	09/07/11	Approved
Calvary Chapel of Dade County, Inc. Owners: Razz W. Vazquez, George Lee, Jorge Menendez, Richard Fernandez	09/07/11	Deferred
Le Jeune Airport Park Suites, Inc. Principals: Rafael Garcia, Dignora Garcia and Nathaly Garcia	10/11/11	Approved
Luis Marrero	10/11/11	Approved

Marist Brothers of the Schools, Inc. Brother Kevin	10/11/11	Approved
Lenay Moya Espinosa	10/11/11	Approved
Lilly Dag	10/11/11	Approved
Armando Hernandez	10/11/11	Deferred
Armando Hernandez Rep. Lionel Dausa	11/09/11	Approved
Alexander & Denise Andreus	11/09/11	Approved
Calvary Chapel of Dade County	12/07/11	Deferred
1097 Le Jeune Investment	01/11/12	Deferred
Arturo and Laura Chiong	01/11/12	Approved
LGV, LLC and Gil at Bird, Inc.	01/11/12	Approved
Marie Quattrocchi	01/11/12	Approved
Ramiro Perez	01/11/12	Approved
Isabianca Investments, LLC	01/11/12	Deferred
Rafael and Caridad Rosa	02/09/12	Approved
Isabianca Investments, LLC	02/09/12	Approved
Coral Lakes Plaza, LLC and Coral Cast Corp., Inc.	02/09/12	Approved
1097 LeJeune Investment, Inc.	02/09/12	Deferred
Jorge A. Rodriguez	03/01/12	Approved
Mayra Fernandez	03/01/12	Approved
Isabianca Investment LLC and Curby Corp.	03/01/12	Approved
Dagoberto Castro	04/04/12	Deferred
1097 LeJeune Investment, Inc. Dagoberto Castro	05/02/12	Approved
Dagoberto Castro	05/02/12	Approved in part
RWRS Saenz, LLC	07/24/12	Approved
Aspuru Mortgage Corp.	07/24/12	Denied w/out prejudice
Blue Lake Development Corp.*	07/24/12	Approved

Findings for CC#10:

Four of the five (5) council members in CC#10 have been in office since 08/24/10. The fifth member, Jorge Barbontin, took office in 08/26/08, however, no campaign treasurer's reports were available for him. The contributors listed on the CTRs, including the officers of corporate contributors, were cross-referenced to the names of zoning applicants and officers of corporate zoning applicants. It was found that one contributor, Blue Lake Development Corp., which contributed \$500 to the campaign of council member Miguel Martinez, filed a zoning application that was approved at the 07/24/12 meeting pursuant to staff's recommendation.

The analysis showed that 62 zoning applications came before CC#10 from the first meeting held after the new candidates took office (09/15/10) through the last meeting held to date. Forty-nine of those applications were ultimately approved while only two were denied

* Blue Lake Development Corp. made a \$500 contribution to council member Miguel Martinez's campaign.

without prejudice. Two applications that were deferred did not return to seek approval within the period in question. Back-up documents are contained in the subject file folder.

Conclusion:

A review of all zoning applications submitted before CC#10 produced only one company that had made campaign contributions to council members—Blue Lake Development Corp. In the absence of additional correlation between campaign contributors and zoning applicants, there is no basis for further inquiry.

